Here are clips from two more articles which have more good information.

1)

Table 6
Best Practices for Online Learning Environments

Category 1: Student Behaviors	Online Research Citation	Classroom Research Citation
Demonstrate their prerequisite technology skills at beginning are adequate for hardware, software and website use	Stith (2000); McNaught et al. (1999); Vrasidas & McIssac (1999); Wegner (1997)	
Seek opportunities to, and support for, interacting with instructor and other students	Ryan (2000); Wegner et al. (1997); Smith & Benscoter (1999)	
Actively participate in all online activities	Saunders et al. (1997); Mende (1998)	Johnson & Johnson (1978)
Actively involved through writing and interaction in web-based courses (improves student writing performance)	Jewett (1998)	
Use a variety of communication techniques To enhance online learning	Shih et al. (1998); McLellan (1997)	
Personalize themselves by publishing online biographies and photographs to allow other members of the class to visualize them	McLellan (1997)	Slavin (1995)
Seek assistance in understanding and mastering different learning strategies	Shih et al. (1998)	
Demonstrate prerequisites and become more proficient in technology communication skills	Vrasidas & McIssac (1999)	
Category 2: Faculty-Student Interactions		

Provide clear and adequate guidance	Wegner (1999); Kroder et al. (1998)	
Use action research regularly to evaluate the success/failure of the course and meet student concerns	Gillani (1998)	
Personalize communications by/with student-student and student-teacher	Jewett (1998); Powers et al. (1998	
Use variety of communication techniques to provide for greater empathy and personal approach than 3-mail and website alone	McLellan (1997)	Stephens & Rosenshine (1986)
35		
Plan for increased time for student interactions as compared to traditional courses	Ryan (2000)	Slavin (1995)
Clearly delineate institutional policy on cheating and plagiarism at start of course	Gray (1998)	
Maintain separate e- mail account for web Courses	Gray (1998)	
Forward responses to frequently asked questions to all students to avoid duplication	Gray (1998)	
Give faculty reduced load and increased support to develop course materials	Gaud (1999)	
Provide students with continuous, frequent support, feedback	Vrasidas & McIssac (1999); Jiang & Ting (1999)	Stephens & Rosenshine (1986)
Scaffold virtual discourse construction	Pincas (1998)	Stephens & Rosenshine(1986)
Emphasize importance of good study skills throughout course	Loomis (2000)	
Closely monitor each student's progress	Loomis (2000)	Brophy & Good (1986)
Create opportunities to coach and facilitate student construction of knowledge	Miller & Miller (1999)	
Give negative comments to students privately, preferably by phone	Rossman (1999)	

Clearly delineate course requirements	Rossman (1999)	Stephens & Rosenshine (1986)

Category 3: Technology Support

Insure a low level of technological difficulties in accessing website and communication	Jewett (1998); Cornell (1999); Wegner et al. (1997)	
Provide adequate, friendly, easy, continuous technical support	Teeter (1997); McNaught et al. (1999); Davies & Mendenhall (1998); Kroder et al. (1998); Gillani (1998)	

Category 4: Learning Environment

Use structured activities to provide an effective framework for online learning	Powers et al.; DeSimone (2000); Mende (1998)	Brophy & Good (1986)
36 Mandate smaller class sizes for online courses to give faculty appropriate time to deliver quality instruction board	Gaud (1999)	Kavale & Glass (1982)
Use flexible deadlines to motivate students, maintain communication, and allow for technical problems	McLellan (1997)	
Create social interaction through group collaboration to facilitate high achievement	Wegner et al. (1997); Blum (1999); Jiang & Ting (1999); Kroder et al. (1998); De Simone et al. (2000); Mende (1998)	Slavin (1995)
Use streaming audio for reading online	Kroder et al (1998)	
Present course content in a manner that hierarchically structures the sequence of information	Miller & Miller (1999)	Brophy & Good (1986)
Organize website to enable student to interact with the content, other students, and instructor	Gillani (1998)	Slavin (1995)

Create welcoming, safe, nurturing online environment	Bonk & Cummings (1998)	
Present problem-solving situations in a realistic context	Miller & Miller (1999)	Prawat (1989)
Provide opportunities for students to question instructor to insure accuracy of understanding	Miller & Miller (1999)	Prawat (1989); Brophy & Good (1986)
Create opportunities for students to communicate with each other to share understanding of course content	Miller & Miller (1999)	Slavin (1995)
Provide opportunities to collaboratively construct knowledge based on multiple perspectives, discussion and reflection	Miller & Miller (1999)	Johnson et al. (1981)
Provide opportunities for students to articulate and revise their thinking to insure accuracy of knowledge construction	Miller & Miller (1999)	Rosenshine & Meister (1996)
Insure equitable environment exists for gender differences in learning styles, reduction of barriers to participation, and communication	Blum (1999)	
Include cooperative and collaborative learning to distribute workload through group and support female students' preferred method of connected learning	Blum (1999)	
Promote gender equality by encouraging females to post messages while asking males to subside if a patterns of male domination is noticed	Blum (1999)	
Insure an equitable learning environment exists for all	Blum (1999)	
Allow time for reflection at end of	Wegerif (1998)	
course Include "warm- up" period with light-hearted exercises aimed to help student get to know one another	Wegerif (1998)	Slavin (1995)
Start online course with all students together at the same time	Wegerif (1998)	
Provide equal access to the shared conversation in the course	Wegerif (1998)	
Provide opportunities for students to control online learning and structure it for themselves	Wegerif (1998)	
Provide discussion forums encouraging	Rossman (1999)	

open and honest dialog

Conduct a teleconference during and at the end of the course to discuss successes and problems	Rossman (1999)
Use computer conferencing to develop overall critical thinking skills	Rossman (1999)

38
Table 7
Checklist for Online Interactive Learning (COIL)
Category 1: Student Behaviors Meets Criterion

1. Demonstrate their prerequisite technology skills at
beginning are adequate for hardware, software and website use 1 2 3 4 5
2. Seek opportunities to, and support for, interacting with
instructor and other students   1 2 3 4 5
3. Actively participate in all online activities   1 2 3 4 5
4. Actively involved through writing and interaction in webbased
courses (improves student writing performance)   1 2 3 4 5
5. Use a variety of communication techniques to enhance
online learning   1 2 3 4 5
6. Personalize themselves by publishing online biographies
and photographs to allow other members of the class to
visualize them   1 2 3 4 5
7. Seek assistance in understanding and mastering different
learning strategies   1 2 3 4 5
8. Demonstrate prerequisites and become more proficient in
technology communication skills   1 2 3 4 5

Total Section Rating

Category 2: Faculty-Student Interactions
9. Provide clear and adequate guidance   1 2 3 4 5
10. Use action research regularly to evaluate the success/failure
of the course and meet student concerns   1 2 3 4 5
11. Personalize communications by/with student-student and
student-teacher   1 2 3 4 5
12. Use variety of communication techniques to provide for
greater empathy and personal approach than 3- mail and
website alone   1 2 3 4 5
13. Plan for increased time for student interactions as compared
to traditional courses   1 2 3 4 5
14. Clearly delineate institutional policy on cheating and
plagiarism at start of course   1 2 3 4 5
15. Maintain separate e-mail account for web courses   1 2 3 4 5
16. Forward responses to frequently asked questions to all
students to avoid duplication   1 2 3 4 5
17. Give faculty reduced load and increased support to develop
course materials   1 2 3 4 5
18. Provide students with continuous, frequent support,
feedback   1 2 3 4 5
19. Scaffold virtual discourse construction   1 2 3 4 5

39

20. Emphasize importance of good study skills throughout
course   1 2 3 4 5
21. Closely monitor each student's progress   1 2 3 4 5
22. Create opportunities to coach and facilitate student
construction of knowledge   1 2 3 4 5
23. Give negative comments to students privately, preferably by
phone   1 2 3 4 5
24. Clearly delineate course requirements   1 2 3 4 5

Total Section Rating

Category 3: Technology Support

25. Insure a low level of technological difficulties in accessing
website and communication
                                                            1 2 3 4 5
26. Provide adequate, friendly, easy, continuous technical
support   1 2 3 4 5

Total Section Rating

Category 4: Learning Environment

27. Use structured activities to provide an effective framework
for online learning   1 2 3 4 5
28. Mandate smaller class sizes for online courses to give
faculty appropriate time to deliver quality instruction board 1 2 3 4 5
29. Use flexible deadlines to motivate students, maintain
communication, and allow for technical problems   1 2 3 4 5
30. Create social interaction through group collaboration to
facilitate high achievement   1 2 3 4 5
31. Use streaming audio for reading online   1 2 3 4 5
32. Present course content in a manner that hierarchically
structures the sequence of information   1 2 3 4 5
33. Organize website to enable student to interact with the
content, other students, and instructor   1 2 3 4 5
34. Create welcoming, safe, nurturing online environment   1 2 3 4 5
35. Present problem-solving situations in a realistic context 1 2 3 4 5
36. Provide opportunities for students to question instructor
to insure accuracy of understanding   1 2 3 4 5
37. Create opportunities for students to communicate with each
other to share understanding of course content   1 2 3 4 5
38. Provide opportunities to collaboratively construct
knowledge based on multiple perspectives, discussion and
reflection   1 2 3 4 5
39. Provide opportunities for students to articulate and revise
their thinking to insure accuracy of knowledge construction 1 2 3 4 5
40. Insure equitable environment exists for gender differences
in learning styles, reduction of barriers to participation, and
communication   1 2 3 4 5

40
41. Include cooperative and collaborative learning to distribute
workload through group and support female students'
preferred method of connected learning   1 2 3 4 5
42. Promote gender equality by encouraging females to post
messages while asking males to subside if a patterns of male

```
domination is noticed                                          1 2 3 4 5
43. Insure an equitable learning environment exists for all    1 2 3 4 5
44. Allow time for reflection at end of course                 1 2 3 4 5
45. Include "warm- up" period with light- hearted exercises
aimed to help student get to know one another                  1 2 3 4 5
46. Start online course with all students together at the same
time                                                           1 2 3 4 5
47. Provide equal access to the shared conversation in the
course                                                         1 2 3 4 5
48. Provide opportunities for students to control online learning
and structure it for themselves                                1 2 3 4 5
49. Provide discussion forums encouraging open and honest
dialog                                                         1 2 3 4 5
50. Conduct a teleconference during and at the end of the course
to discuss successes and problems                              1 2 3 4 5
51. Use computer conferencing to develop overall critical
thinking skills                                                1 2 3 4 5


Total Section Rating
Total Score
```

2) This is from a previous article but with good rubric of student-student & teacher involvement.

F:\Staff\markb\Masters Program\870 class\Best Practices for Administrative Evaluation of Online Faculty.htm

> The most important variable in any online instructor's methods is the level of interaction among the students, the instructor, and the outside world (either virtually or in "real time and space"). M. D. Roblyer and Leticia Ekhaml have compiled an excellent rubric for determining interactivity, one of the defining characteristics of online learning from the COIL checklist. Administrators should look for the following measurable attributes:
>
> Few interactive qualities: the instructor does not encourage students to get to know one another on a personal basis. No activities require social interaction, or are limited to brief introductions at the beginning of the course. Instructional activities do not require two-way interaction between instructor and students; they call for one-way delivery of information (e. g., instructor lectures, text delivery). Fax, web, or other technology resource allows one-way (instructor to student) delivery of information (text and/or graphics). By the end of the course, all students in the class are interacting with instructor and other students only when required.
>
> Minimum interactive qualities: in addition to brief introductions, the instructor provides for one other exchange of personal information among students, e.g., written bio of personal background and experiences. Instructional activities require students to communicate with the instructor on an individual basis only (e. g., asking/responding to instructor questions). E-mail, listserv, bulletin board or

other technology resource allows two-way, asynchronous exchanges of information (text and/or graphics). By the end of the course, between 20-25% of students in the class are initiating interaction with the instructor and other students on a voluntary basis (i.e., other than when required).

Moderate interactive qualities: in addition to providing for exchanges of personal information among students, the instructor provides at least one other in-class activity designed to increase social rapport among students. In addition to the requiring students to communicate with the instructor, instructional activities require students to work with one another (e. g., in pairs or small groups) and share results within their pairs/groups. In addition to technologies used for two-way asynchronous exchanges of text information, chat room or other technology allows synchronous exchanges of written information. By the end of the course, between 25-50% of students in the class are initiating interaction with the instructor and other students on a voluntary basis (i.e., other than when required).

Above average interactive qualities: in addition to providing for exchanges of personal information among students, the instructor provides several other in-class activities designed to increase social rapport among students. In addition to the requiring students to communicate with the instructor, instructional activities require students to work with one another (e. g., in pairs or small groups) and share results with one another and the rest of the class. In addition to technologies used for two-way, asynchronous exchanges of text information, additional technologies (e. g., teleconferencing) allow one-way visual and two-way voice communications between instructor and students. By the end of the course, between 50-75% of students in the class are initiating interaction with the instructor and other students on a voluntary basis (i.e., other than when required).

High level of interactive qualities: in addition to providing for exchanges of personal information among students, the instructor provides a variety of in-class and outside-class activities designed to increase social rapport among students. In addition to the requiring students to communicate with the instructor, instructional activities require students to work with one another (e. g., in pairs or small groups) and outside experts and share results with one another and the rest of the class. In addition to technologies to allow two-way exchanges of text information, visual technologies such as two-way video or videoconferencing technologies allow synchronous voice & visual communications between instructor and students and among students. By the end of the course, over 75% of students in the class are initiating interaction with the instructor and other students on a voluntary basis (i.e., other than when required). (Roblyer and Ekhaml)

It is tempting to take the need for online-specific instructor-evaluation instruments to its extreme and call for an entirely separate means of assessing the performance of online instructors. The outcomes of any course, regardless of the medium in which it is delivered, should remain the same in every iteration. In fact, the means by which students evaluate the effectiveness of their instruction seems not to need

changing between classroom-based and online courses. Indeed, when student-evaluation instruments were tested against delivery medium in early 2004, the results, published in the Journal of Interactive Online Learning, are helpful in defining the reasons for making medium-specific changes to the instruments used in any evaluation: